What Social Science Research from the Last 20 Years Says About the Effects of Integrated Education on Achievement Outcomes

Roslyn Arlin Mickelson
Professor of Sociology and Public Policy
University of North Carolina at Charlotte

RoslynMickelson@uncc.edu

Testimony to the Minnesota Integration Advisory Task Force
December 20, 2011
Key Finding: Preponderance of Studies Since 1990 Indicates

- Creating integrated schools and avoiding segregation can contribute significantly to
  - Narrowing the race and SES gaps in outcomes
  - Improving achievement for all students
Integration promotes

- Higher achievement across the curriculum
- Benefits accrue to students in all grades, especially those in secondary school
- Youth from all racial and SES groups benefit—including middle-class whites
- Disadvantaged minority youth gain the most
- No systematic evidence of harm to anyone from integration
Why?: Likely Reasons for Integrated Schools’ Successes

- Highly qualified teachers more likely to stay
- Greater parental & community involvement
- Greater continuity in programs, students, & staff
- Fewer students identified for expensive special education
- Academically oriented peers push everyone
- Climate that fosters higher order thinking skills
Four Examples of Recent Studies

- Harris (2006) nationwide NCLB data
- Southworth (2010) North Carolina statewide data
- Condron (2009) nationally representative data
Spivack Archive

- A user-friendly searchable electronic database with detailed abstracts of the 500 studies on which this testimony is based

- [http://sociology.uncc.edu/people/rmickelson/spivackFrameset.html](http://sociology.uncc.edu/people/rmickelson/spivackFrameset.html)
Figure I. Model of Dynamics of Integrated Schooling and Social Cohesion in Multiethnic Democratic Societies

Diverse Schools

Short-term Outcomes for K-12 Students
- Greater achievement across the curriculum for all youth
- Reduction in prejudice and cross-racial fears
- Increase in mutual trust, respect, and acceptance
- Increase in cross-racial peers
- Greater capacity for multicultural navigation

Long-term Outcomes for Adults
- Greater educational and occupational attainment
- Workplace readiness for the global economy
- Adult cross-racial friendships, mutual trust, respect, & acceptance
- Choice of integrated neighborhoods
- Avoidance of criminal justice system
- Democratic values and attitudes
- Civic engagement

Social Cohesion in Multiethnic Democratic Societies
Changes in Black-White Test Score Gap

Black-White Achievement Gap on NAEP Math Tests

- age 9
- age 13
- age 17
- average gap

Points

- 50
- 45
- 40
- 35
- 30
- 25
- 20
- 15
- 10
- 5
- 0

Years:
- 1973
- 1978
- 1982
- 1986
- 1990
- 1992
- 1994
- 1996
- 1999
- 2004
- 2008
Surmounting Obstacles to Integrated Schools

- Change public narrative about integrated education
- Provide resources to school systems working for diversity
- Base policy on scientific evidence, not anecdotes or ideology
- Cease trying to make segregated schools ‘successful’
What Policy Makers Can Do to Change the Public Narrative About Integration

- Publicize the fact that all students can benefit academically from integrated schools
- Look to corporate world and military as models of diversity
  - Department of Defense Schools
- Coordinate housing and education policy for diversity
  - Housing policy is *de facto* education policy
Model of Dynamics of Integrated Housing, Integrated Education, and Short- and Long-term Outcomes in Multiethnic Democratic Societies

Integrated Housing

Integrated Education

Short-term Outcomes for K-12 Students

Long-term Outcomes for Adults

- Greater achievement across the curriculum
- Reduction in prejudice and cross-racial fears
- Increase in mutual trust, respect, and acceptance
- Increase in cross-racial friendships
- Greater capacity for multicultural navigation

- Greater educational and occupational attainment
- Workplace readiness for the global economy
- Cross-racial friendships, mutual trust, respect, and acceptance
- Living in integrated neighborhoods
- Democratic values and attitudes
- Civic participation, including voting, community involvement
- Avoidance of the criminal justice system
Conclusion

- Integrated education should be added to the list of “What Works”

- Integration is an effective policy with relatively few financial costs

Thank you
Why Recent Integration Research is Superior to Earlier Research

- Better samples
- Assessments long after desegregation implemented
- Valid and reliable measures
- Often longitudinal data
- Advanced statistical modeling
  - Nesting of students in schools, schools in districts, etc.
  - Disentangles school race effects from SES effects
Table 1: Number and Percent of Social Science Citations by Decade in PICs Social Science Amici Briefs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Murphy et al</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N = 20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armor et al</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N = 29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APA</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N = 57</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AERA</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N = 54</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>553 SOCIAL SCIENTISTS</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N=213</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>